

ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT ASSESSMENT (EIA)

EIA: 12/12/20/944

**FOR THE PROPOSED ESKOM NUCLEAR POWER STATION AND
ASSOCIATED INFRASTRUCTURE**

DRAFT ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT ASSESSMENT REPORT

KEY FOCUS GROUP MEETING

SEA VISTA FORUM & CENTRE FOR ENVIRONMENTAL RIGHTS

18 NOVEMBER 2010

18H30 – 20H00

TABLE OF CONTENTS

TABLE OF CONTENTS	2
PREFACE	3
1. ATTENDANCE.....	4
1.1. Attendance – Sea Vista Forum and Associates	4
1.2 Attendance – Centre for Environmental Rights (CER)	4
1.3 Attendance – Applicant - Eskom Holdings Limited.....	4
1.3 Attendance – Independent Environmental Consultants – Arcus GIBB (Pty) Ltd	4
2. WELCOME AND INTRODUCTIONS.....	4
3. DISCUSSION SESSION.....	6
4. CLOSING REMARKS	15
ATTENDANCE LIST	16

PREFACE

Should participants who attended the meetings require any changes to these proceedings, please notify the Arcus GIBB Public Participation Office (Nuclear1@gibb.co.za) in writing within 14 days of receipt.

“**Unidentified I&APs**” refer largely to persons who attended the meeting and verbally raised issues without providing their names. This in no way diminishes the value of the issue raised. Should you recognise your input and would like to have your name recorded next to it, please advise the Public Participation Office.

In order to provide a structure and to enable the reader to follow the proceedings with ease the minutes have not been captured verbatim and post-meeting notes have been added for clarity and information purposes and are indicated in **bold**.

1. ATTENDANCE

1.1. Attendance – Sea Vista Forum and Associates

Name	Organisation
Tobeka Petse	Sea Vista Forum
Isak Coenraad	Sea Vista Forum
Patrick Fredericks	Sea Vista Forum
Petrus Leen	Sea Vista Forum
Sydney Lamont	Sea Vista Forum
A. Malgas	Sea Vista Forum
Edward Busakwe	Sea Vista Resident
K. Sibeno	Community Development Workers DPLG
Elvis Olivier	Kouga Municipality
Mayor R. Dennis	Kouga Municipality
D. Ras	ANC Representative
K. Papa	ANC Secretary
C. Barratt	St. Francis Kromme Trust
T. Malan	Thyspunt Alliance

1.3 Attendance – Centre for Environmental Rights (CER)

Name	Role in the project
Melissa Fourie	Director CER; Legal representation for Sea Vista Forum
U. Sobekwa	Legal representation for Sea Vista Forum

1.2 Attendance – Applicant - Eskom Holdings Limited (Eskom)

Name	Position/ Role in the project
Deidre Herbst	Senior Manager - Environment Generation Division

1.3 Attendance – Independent Environmental Consultants – Arcus GIBB (Pty) Ltd (GIBB)

Name	Position/ Role in the project
Jaana-Maria Ball	Nuclear-1 EIA: Project Manager
Inge Schovell	Environmental Scientist

2. WELCOME AND INTRODUCTIONS

Ms. Melissa Fourie welcomed everyone to the meeting and thanked them for being punctual. She then introduced herself as the Director of CER representing the Sea Vista Forum and asked the meeting attendees to introduce themselves one by one to the group. Introductions were done as per Sections 1.1 to 1.5.

Ms. Fourie stated that the purpose of this meeting was to raise the rights of the Sea Vista community with Eskom and the environmental consultants responsible for the Nuclear-1 EIA.

Ms. Fourie stated that the Sea Vista Forum members had invited a number of other key stakeholders in the community to attend the meeting as observers.

A draft agenda was handed out to all participants and adopted by all present for use during the meeting.

3. DISCUSSION SESSION

This section details all issues, comments and concerns, which were raised and discussed at the meeting. Should you wish to make any corrections, please advise GIBB within two weeks (i.e. 14 days) of receiving these minutes.

SEA VISTA FORUM AND CENTRE FOR ENVIRONMENTAL RIGHTS			
No	Name	Comment	Response
1	Mr. Dennis	He asked how long the meeting will be and also stated that it should not be rushed.	Ms. Fourie stated that it was expected that the meeting be 1 hour in duration.
2	Ms. Fourie	<p>She stated that this Key Focus Group Meeting was offered by GIBB and Eskom to the Sea Vista Forum in order for the members of the Sea Vista Forum to explain their concerns regarding the public consultation process for the Nuclear-1 Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA) and give suggestions on how to improve the meetings in Sea Vista, as well as discuss the way forward with respect to the EIA process.</p> <p>Ms. Fourie then referred to action 3 on the agenda and asked Ms Ball to provide an update on the EIA process and encourage Forum members to ask questions about it.</p>	<p>Ms. Ball stated that GIBB has held four productive public meetings previously in the Community Hall as part of the Nuclear-1 EIA. At each meeting the facilitator/ GIBB had requested suggestions from the community members present as to how the EIA Team could improve the meetings. GIBB has facilitated the present meeting in order to again listen to suggestions as to how to improve the public consultation process for the Nuclear-1 EIA. To date suggestions for meetings have included the preference for meetings to be held during the week (but not Fridays) after working hours. It has also been suggested that independent Xhosa and Afrikaans translators be employed at the meetings. All these useful suggestions have been used to improve the public participation process going forward.</p> <p>Ms. Ball reported that GIBB had received many comments on the Draft Environmental Impact Report (EIR) and were busy compiling responses to these comments, with the assistance of its specialists. The responses to the issues would be distributed to the relevant I&APs once complete. The Revised EIR and EMP will then be produced and the changes explained to all I&APs. It is not possible, however, to give exact dates for the release of these revised reports because the specialists are still</p>

SEA VISTA FORUM AND CENTRE FOR ENVIRONMENTAL RIGHTS			
No	Name	Comment	Response
			busy with the revision of their reports.
3	Ms. Fourie	Asked how the National Nuclear Regulator (NNR) intersects with the EIA process?	Ms. Ball stated that the NNR and the Department of Environmental Affairs had signed a Memorandum of Understanding regarding the evaluation of applications for nuclear facilities, a copy of which is included in the Draft EIR. It is GIBB's understanding that the NNR has its own process with its own public participation process and its own scheduled documents that the public will be able to review. The NNR has the expertise to review and make decisions on the technological and nuclear issues whereas the DEA has the expertise to evaluate potential environmental impacts. The DEA has informed GIBB that they will not make decisions on aspects such as nuclear safety and radiological issues.
4	Mr. Fredericks	He stated that the documentation provided is not easy to understand and that that it should be in Xhosa and Afrikaans as well.	Ms. Ball stated it was understandable that much of the information was not easy to understand as it was very technical in nature. She stated that GIBB could try and explain processes better using diagrams and better explain the NNR and EIA process in the Revised Draft EIR. She then said that if anyone had any suggestions on how to better GIBB could explain the issues and processes presented in the Draft EIR that they should let her know.
5	Ms. Fourie	Ms. Fourie requested that the acronyms be explained to the group as the meeting proceeds to create a better understanding of the subject matter being discussed.	Ms. Ball suggested that GIBB would have flowcharts and diagrams to assist in explanations at public meetings in future. She acknowledged the comment and undertook on behalf of the EIA team to adequately explain all acronyms used in public meetings.
6	Mr. Dennis	Mr. Dennis said that the Minister made a premature announcement on EIA related issues which created a	Ms Ball stated that she presumes that the announcement referred to the Minister of Art and Culture's statements about

SEA VISTA FORUM AND CENTRE FOR ENVIRONMENTAL RIGHTS			
No	Name	Comment	Response
		lot of animosity amongst the local community. He asked how the community/ EIA Team responds to such announcements?	the heritage aspects of the Thyspunt site. She mentioned that she had spoken to SAHRA and other affected parties regarding the issue. SAHRA has stated that they are waiting for the Revised EIR, which will include the revised heritage assessment, before they make any further comment into the EIA process.
7	Mr. Leen	Is Eskom putting forward a plan for the nuclear reactor? Mr. Leen further asked what the plan of action is with respect to safety measures in case of any incidents occurring. He would like Eskom and the NNR to explain the health and safety aspect of the proposed project to the group.	Ms. Herbst undertook to speak to her Eskom colleague at the Koeberg Nuclear Power Station with the view of organising a joint Eskom and NNR community education session regarding the different processes and the safety aspects of nuclear power stations.
8	Mr. Olivier	Mr. Olivier added on to Mr. Leen's question by asking if the EIA will still follow the process outlined would that mean that it will take even longer? Maybe 2 to 3 years extra?	<p>Ms Ball said that there are over 20 permits to be applied for by Eskom for the nuclear power station that do not involve GIBB at all, and are separate from the EIA process.</p> <p>Ms.Herbst said that there are 2 main processes to be followed by Eskom namely the NNR and the nuclear licensing process, as well as the EIA process. She went on to say that it is not just about putting forward a plan to the NNR. It involves more than just Eskom and the NNR but that it also involves the local Council and the local community, and that it would be specific to the design and structure of the proposed plant.</p> <p>She stated that as Eskom starts with the licensing process, all the detail of the process must be communicated with the public and the local Council so that everyone is involved with the development of the emergency plan. She also stated that the community asked to see the Koeberg Nuclear Power Station a few months ago and they then took 10 Sea Vista community</p>

SEA VISTA FORUM AND CENTRE FOR ENVIRONMENTAL RIGHTS			
No	Name	Comment	Response
		<p>Mr. Olivier further asked that if this Nuclear plant is supposed to be the 'Rolls Royce' of all, will its emergency plans be the same as that of the Koeberg Nuclear Power Station?</p> <p>The zones are confusing as it always changes. This needs to stop.</p>	<p>members to the site. Ms Herbst said that it was presumed that the detail Koeberg's emergency plan and how it worked was covered during this tour.</p> <p>Ms. Herbst said that it will be similar to Koeberg but that the exclusion zones that the Koeberg Nuclear Power Station has, the widest of which is 16 km, will be 3 kms in the case of the proposed Nuclear-1. As nuclear stations get built they improve on safety each time which means exclusion zones could become smaller. Eskom, with the local authorities will have to develop and manage an emergency plan for the employees at the nuclear power station and the surrounding communities. The plan must incorporate the NNR requirements.</p>
9	Ms. Malan	<p>Ms. Malan stated that the NNR had been in the St. Francis Bay/ Sea Vista area to meet with the local community and the community still does not know what is happening.</p> <p>Ms. Malan added that it was questionable as to whether the local Municipality could afford all necessary infrastructure.</p> <p>She also asked how all the residents and visitors in the area would get out of the area using one road?</p>	<p>Ms. Ball reiterated Ms. Herbst's suggestion of educational sessions to inform the public about issues that they do not understand.</p> <p>The comment was noted.</p> <p>Ms. Herbst stated that if the DEA approves the proposed nuclear power station they would add conditions from the EIR that Eskom will have to comply to.</p>
10	Mr. Olivier	Mr. Olivier stated that the next public meeting should be in Afrikaans and Xhosa.	Ms. Ball confirmed that an independent Afrikaans and Xhosa translator would be in attendance at the next public meetings in

SEA VISTA FORUM AND CENTRE FOR ENVIRONMENTAL RIGHTS			
No	Name	Comment	Response
		<p>He also said, “n Druive verkoper sal druive verkoop wat nie goed is nie, maar hy sal se dat dit goed is.” Mr. Olivier then suggested that maybe the NNR should also attend the next meeting to create balance.</p>	<p>Sea Vista.</p>
11	Mr. Dennis	<p>Mr. Dennis said that there is a communication gap between the community and the EIA Team. When there is no link between the community, the consultants and Eskom that is operating at a national level then you will find a bad situation because who will the people feel comfortable with?</p> <p>He stated that the municipality has been left out of this process. People want to know what the municipality says about this but they cannot comment as they have not been kept informed. He further stated that that the EIA Team would need to find a way to involve local institutions or state.</p> <p>He then referred to the EIA process itself and said that the reading material was not user friendly and that that needed to be changed to assist in creating a better understanding for the average person.</p>	<p>Ms Ball said that they welcome any assistance from the Mayor's Office.</p> <p>Ms. Ball disagreed and stated that a number of Key Focus Group Meetings had been held with the Kouga Municipality and that Municipal officials had been invited to all stakeholder meetings held in the area. Additionally she is willing to set up meetings with the Municipality in the future.</p>
12	Unidentified I&AP	<p>It was said that Eskom is playing 'cat and mouse'. It was said that the Municipality was thought to be relied on by the community</p>	<p>The comment was noted.</p>
13	Mrs Petse	<p>She said that she is surprised that this development was not known to the Municipality.</p>	<p>Ms. Ball stated that they have had 2 Key Focus Meetings to date with the Kouga Municipality as well as public meetings to which the Municipality was invited. There are minutes of these meetings available to the public.</p>

SEA VISTA FORUM AND CENTRE FOR ENVIRONMENTAL RIGHTS			
No	Name	Comment	Response
14	Mr. Malgas	Mr. Malgas said that he expected this to happen. He asked how he was supposed understand what all the terminology meant, let alone his mother, if the Mayor does not know?	The comment was noted.
15	Mr. Olivier	Mr. Olivier suggested that whenever there are meetings held that the Municipal Head should be emailed directly and the Mayor copied into the correspondence.	Comment noted. Ms. Ball said that she will take the Mayors cell number and keep in contact with him with regards his attendance at future public meetings.
16	Mr. Coenraad	Mr. Coenraad said that he was concerned about the traffic influx and the potential impact on the children in the area.	Ms. Ball acknowledged the comment and stated that both the traffic and transportation specialist, as well as the social specialist has addressed this aspect in their revised reports.
17	Ms. Malan	She stated that as an independent consultant, GIBB should also invite the specialists to meetings so that both sides are heard. She stated that all they have been hearing is one side of the story.	Ms. Ball said that GIBB is responsible for the EIA, including the public consultation process. On occasion specialists may be asked to present the findings of their studies at public meetings. She further stated that public meetings are open and that no-one will be excluded from them. She also said that GIBB always allowed meetings to run for as long as necessary and if more are needed they will arrange additional meetings.
18	Ms. Fourie	<p>Ms. Fourie summarised action items up to that point of the meeting:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Emails to be sent directly to the Municipal head and the mayor copied into these emails. 2. Different languages to be used in material distributed and the NNR invited to attend the meetings. 3. Material explaining the NNR and EIA 	<p>To clarify the actions Ms. Ball listed them namely:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. The community does not understand the NNR and the EIA process but GIBB will do what they can to alleviate this problem at next public meetings by using posters etc. Ms. Herbst would try and assist in getting the NNR to come address the community. Post Meeting Note: Contact details of the NNR were provided to Melissa Fourie.

SEA VISTA FORUM AND CENTRE FOR ENVIRONMENTAL RIGHTS			
No	Name	Comment	Response
		<p>processes should be developed by the various responsible parties and distributed in the community.</p> <p>She further made reference to a letter sent to GIBB by the CER, on behalf of the Sea Vista Forum, and summarised some of the main concerns contained therein.</p>	<p>Ms. Ball commented by explaining that posters and sketch drawings were used during the first meetings held in Sea Vista to explain processes. She also said that independent translators were present namely Mr. Reuben Heydenrych, of Arcus GIBB, who undertook all the Afrikaans translations. A gentleman from Eskom undertook the Xhosa translations as he has a working knowledge of the technical issues. At the time the attendees of the meeting were satisfied with the arrangement. GIBB would, however, arrange for an independent Xhosa translator for the next meetings. GIBB has also taken note of the dates, days and times suggested by the community for next public meeting. The community must note that if the entire meeting's proceedings are to be translated from English into Afrikaans and Xhosa the meetings would take a number of hours in duration.</p>
19	Mr. Malgas	<p>Mr. Malgas questioned the protocol followed at the public meetings. He stated that at the public meetings held at the St. Francis Links Golf Club there were only consultants present whereas here at this meeting there are Eskom representatives as well. He felt that the same protocol should be used for all public meetings. He also said that all meetings must have translators.</p> <p>He further stated that Eskom only presents what the people want to hear and that they do not speak about</p>	<p>Ms. Ball stated that during all public meetings if questions are asked about nuclear power and the design of the proposed nuclear power plant, those questions can only be referred to the Applicant - Eskom. She added that at the last meeting at Sea Vista, Mr. Heydenrych of Arcus GIBB was present as well as two independent technical specialists. The only difference between the meetings of Sea Vista and the one held at The Links Golf Club was that the one at the Links had the presentation only in English, as there was not request for translations into other languages.</p> <p>The comment was noted.</p>

SEA VISTA FORUM AND CENTRE FOR ENVIRONMENTAL RIGHTS			
No	Name	Comment	Response
		the socio-economic issues.	
20	Ms. Malan	Ms. Malan said that issues are not being addressed and that presentations are too long leaving little time for questions. She added that practicalities do not get addressed. She asked why one meeting could not be held for all communities, black, white etc. they do not want to hear a lot, only about what is going to happen. Such as is there going to be job creation and what experience is needed to get these jobs? Ms Malan further suggested that maybe the next meeting should be a question and answer session with no presentations.	Ms Ball stated that if community members wish to send GIBB queries before the meetings GIBB would address these queries in the meeting. Also it was not always easy for communities to come to one meeting because the did not always feel comfortable doing so.
21	Mr. Dennis	Mr. Dennis asked if there is a social impact assessment and if he could see it.	Ms. Ball confirmed that there is and it was one of the appendices to the Draft EIR available on www.eskom.co.za and www.projects.gibb.co.za . She undertook to have a CD delivered to the Mayor the following week.
22	Ms. Malan	She asked if the EIR could be divided into 3 separate reports – one for each of the alternative sites.	Ms. Ball independently replied that this was impractical at this late stage in the EIA and would necessitate the revision of all the specialist studies which would be time consuming and expensive. Ms Herbst confirmed that this request was not practical since the studies needed to make an assessment of the impacts as well as compare the impacts on the different sites.
23	Ms. Fourie	Ms. Fourie stated that the Sea Vista community was not asking for the entire report to be translated but merely the executive summary of each report. Accessibility should also be addressed and a copy or the entire report should be left at the office of the Sea	Comment noted and GIBB undertook to have the Executive Summary of the Main Report, as well as all the specialist reports translated into Xhosa and Afrikaans. Ms. Ball undertook to arrange for the copies of the Revised Draft EIR to be placed at the public places requested.

SEA VISTA FORUM AND CENTRE FOR ENVIRONMENTAL RIGHTS			
No	Name	Comment	Response
		Vista Hall, the clinic, the mini market in addition to the Municipal Offices.	
24	Mr. Papa	He stated that loud hailers should be used to announce meetings.	Ms. Ball acknowledged the request and stated that loud hailers would be used, as had been done for past meetings in Sea Vista.
25	Ms. Fourie	Ms. Fourie suggested that announcements be made at the local crèche, primary school and the church. She also said that independent translators should be used. She then asked when the next meeting will take place.	Ms. Ball acknowledged the request and stated that every attempt would be made to advertise the meeting at all community facilities. Ms Ball replied that the next round of meeting would only take place in 2011.
25	Unidentified I&AP	Why are there police at the meetings?	Ms. Herbst stated that some of the EIA Team members and Eskom officials had been threatened and for this reason police and private detectives had been present at all public meetings.
26	Mr. Malgas	He said that when comparing the meetings it is seen that at The Links Golf Club there were surveillance cameras but at the Sea Vista meeting there were many policemen.	The comment was noted and Ms. Ball confirmed that policemen were present at all the meetings.
27	Mr. Leen	Mr. Leen said that it was problematic to hold meetings on Fridays when people typically started partying at the start of the weekend. He stated that the best day to hold meetings in Sea Vista was a Wednesday.	The comment was noted and Ms. Ball confirmed that future meetings would be held on a Wednesday evening and the CER would be consulted, as a representative of the Sea Vista Forum, before the meeting date was finalised.
28	Ms. Fourie	What do you want to achieve at meetings?	Ms. Herbst suggested that there should be a short period before the meeting where individuals could come and discuss the

SEA VISTA FORUM AND CENTRE FOR ENVIRONMENTAL RIGHTS			
No	Name	Comment	Response
			issues. Ms. Ball added that suggestions for the format and time of the meeting should come from the community and that GIBB would rely on the CER to communicate any preferences to GIBB.
29	Mr. Dennis	Stated that as elections were imminent, there would be door-to-door visits to the community and that that could be used as a means to gather questions from the community.	The comment was noted.
30	Mr. Malgas	Mr. Malgas stated that he is happy that the Sea Vista community's issues were being heard.	The comment was noted.

4. CLOSING REMARKS

Ms. Fourie said that it should be remembered that it is important that the community understands the EIA process and thanked all for attendance at the meeting. She then closed the meeting at 19:51.

ATTENDANCE LIST

Surname	First Names	Title	Co/Org	Sea Vista Forum and CER Key Focus Group Meeting - 18 November 2010
Fourie	Melissa	Ms	CER	Attended
Sobekwa	U.	Ms	CER	Attended
Petse	Tobeka	Mr.s	Sea Vista Forum	Attended
Coenraad	Isak	Mr.	Sea Vista Forum	Attended
Fredericks	Patrick	Mr.	Sea Vista Forum	Attended
Leen	Petrus	Mr.	Sea Vista Forum	Attended
Lamont	Sydney	Mr.	Sea Vista Forum	Attended
Malgas	A.	Mr.	Sea Vista Forum	Attended
Busakwe	Edward	Mr.	Sea Vista Resident	Attended
Sibeno	K.	Mr.	Community Development Workers DPLG	Attended
Olivier	Elvis	Mr.	Kouga Municipality	Attended
Dennis	R.	Mr.	Kouga Municipality (Mayor)	Attended
Ras	D.	Mr.	ANC Representative	Attended
Papa	K.	Mr.	ANC Secretary	Attended
Barratt	C.	Mr.	St. Francis Kromme Trust	Attended
Malan	T.	Mrs.	Thyspunt Alliance	Attended
Herbst	Deidre	Ms	Eskom Holdings limited	Attended
Ball	Jaana-Maria	Ms	Arcus GIBB (Pty) Ltd	Attended
Schovell	Inge	Ms	Arcus GIBB (Pty) Ltd	Attended